



# Land Use

Courthouse Annex • 2045 13th Street • Boulder, Colorado 80302 • Tel: 303.441.3930 • Fax: 303.441.4856  
Mailing Address: P.O. Box 471 • Boulder, Colorado 80306 • [www.bouldercounty.org](http://www.bouldercounty.org)

## **HISTORIC PRESERVATION ADVISORY BOARD**

**Thursday, October 6, 2016 – 6:00 p.m.**  
Commissioners Hearing Room  
Third Floor of the Boulder County Courthouse

### **AGENDA**

1. Citizen participation for items not otherwise on the agenda
2. Approval of minutes from previous meetings
3. Building Permit Reviews for Structures 50 Years of Age and Older
4. Presentations from Parks and Open Space:
  - a. Wildfire Mitigation for POS Structures Update
  - b. POS Projects Update from Carol Beam
5. Other Business



# Land Use

Courthouse Annex • 2045 13th Street • Boulder, Colorado 80302 • Tel: 303.441.3930 • Fax: 303.441.4856  
Mailing Address: P.O. Box 471 • Boulder, Colorado 80306 • [www.bouldercounty.org](http://www.bouldercounty.org)

## BOULDER COUNTY HISTORIC PRESERVATION ADVISORY BOARD

### MINUTES

June 2, 2016

6:00 PM

Hearing Room, Third Floor,  
County Courthouse, Boulder

*Draft draft draft draft draft*

On Thursday, June 2, 2016, the Boulder County Historic Preservation Advisory Board held a regular meeting, convening at 6:00 p.m. and adjourning at 7:55 p.m.

Board Members Present: Jim Burrus - chair, Steven Barnard, Ilona Dotterer, Marissa Ferreira, Charles Gray and Stan Nilson

Board Members Excused: Jason Emery, Rosslyn Scamehorn and George Schusler

Staff Present: Denise Grimm and Jessica Fasick, Land Use  
Mindy Carson Hatcher, Parks and Open Space

Interested Others: 7

### 1. CITIZEN PARTICIPATION

None.

### 2. MINUTES

Approval of the May 5, 2016 Historic Preservation Advisory Board Minutes:

**MOTION:** Charles Gray **MOVED** to approve the May 5, 2016 minutes as submitted.

**SECOND:** Stan Nilson

**VOTE:** Motion **PASSED** unanimously

Vote missed by Marissa Ferreira who arrived at 6:02pm.

### 3. BUILDING PERMIT REVIEWS FOR STRUCTURES 50 YEARS & OLDER

None.

### 4. OTHER BUSINESS, PART ONE

Erica Crosby, Senior Environmental Protection Specialist with the Colorado Division of Reclamation, Mining and Safety, gave an update on mine closures in Boulder County.

### 5. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

a. **Docket CA-16-0003: Altona Grange**

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for a barn quilt to be added to the Altona Grange  
Location: 9386 N 39<sup>th</sup> Street  
Zoning: Agricultural (A) Zoning  
Applicant: Dawn DeAno

Staff member, Denise Grimm, gave the staff presentation. The Altona Grange building was landmarked with Boulder County in 1999. The Altona Grange was established in 1891 and the grange hall was built in 1896. The building has had alterations over the years although they all date to before 1949. It was landmarked under the following criteria:

**Criteria #1** - The grange contributes to Boulder County history. It is one of the few remaining grange structures in the county and has been a center for agricultural and social activities for around 100 years.

**Criteria #3** - The grange is associated with a long list of Boulder County pioneers. Details about these associations can be found on pages 7 through 9 of the application form.

**Criteria #4** - The grange hall was built in a style similar to the frame homes and schoolhouses being constructed in the plains in the late 1800s. The hall also has the same dimensions as the Pleasant View Grange (95th Street) with the exception of ceilings that are two feet higher.

A proposal to alter the historic grange has been submitted. The proposal is to add a barn quilt under the gable end on the west side of the building using either screws or chains.

A barn quilt is a pattern taken from a quilt block and transferred to a 4' x 4' panel which is then mounted on a building, typically a barn but also other rural structures. Barn quilt groups have sprung up across the United States and Canada recently to create quilt trails or driving tours with several barn quilts on display. Patterns chosen often have a regional significance.

Adorning barns with patterns has a long but geographically-isolated history in the United States dating back to at least the 1850s in the Pennsylvania Dutch region. Hex signs, as they are known, are part of Pennsylvania Dutch folk art tradition and can be found on barns throughout southeastern Pennsylvania.

While barn quilts are not the same as hex signs, they do evoke the Pennsylvania Dutch folk art tradition and several barn quilt websites specifically mention the tradition as inspiration. However, regardless of whether or not there is any perceived association, the introduction of non-historic elements on historic structures is contrary to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation as well as to the Boulder County criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

### **Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation**

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. **Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.**

### **Land Use Code, Article 15-600**

#### **F. Criteria for Approval of Alterations Requested Under a CA**

1. In considering the application for a CA, HPAB uses the following criteria:
  - a. *The proposed alterations do not destroy or substantially impair the historic significance of the structure, site, or district.*
  - b. *Every reasonable effort shall be made to ensure that the proposed alteration preserves, enhances, or restores the significant architectural features which are important to the designated historic landmark.*
  - c. *The proposed architectural style, arrangement, texture, color, and materials are compatible with the character of the historic landmark.*

### **RECOMMENDATION**

Staff finds that the proposal for a barn quilt on the Altona Grange does not meet the Criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness and recommends denial of CA-16-0003. The introduction of a non-historic element is not appropriate and is contrary to Criteria b and c of the Land Use Code. Not only is a barn quilt not part of the Altona Grange's rich history, it could easily be interpreted as a hex sign from the Pennsylvania Dutch heritage, which is clearly not appropriate for a Boulder County landmark.

Dawn DeAno, the applicant, spoke about the proposal and was available for questions.

### **OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT**

- James Hogan, 5800 Galatia
- Cheryl Hogan, 5800 Galatia

### **CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT**

**MOTION:**     **Steven Barnard MOVED that HPAB deny Docket CA-16-0003: Altona Grange**

**SECOND:**     **Marissa Ferreira**

**VOTE: Motion PASSED unanimously**

**b. Docket CA-16-0004: Shannon Farm**

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for a barn quilt to be added to the Shannon Farm  
Location: 1341 N 95th Street  
Zoning: Rural Residential (RR) Zoning  
Applicant: Carol Affleck

Staff member, Denise Grimm, gave the staff presentation. The Shannon Farm was landmarked with Boulder County in 2000. The contributing structures are the farmhouse, the barn with the attached silo, and the milkhouse. The farmhouse was built c. 1915 (corrected to c. 1900) and the barn is believed to have been built in the late 1910s. The milkhouse was presumably built around the same time as the farm was a dairy farm in the 1920s and 30s (corrected to up until the 1940s). The farm was landmarked under the following criteria:

**Criteria #1** - The farm qualifies for its association with the theme of agriculture in the Boulder Valley.

**Criteria #3** - The farm is associated with the Shannon Family who were dairy farmers and owned the property from 1918 to 1949.

**Criteria #4** - The structures qualify for their architectural merit. The wood-frame side-gable house has a high degree of integrity. The barn and attached silo are rare for the Boulder County area, being constructed of clay tile. The milkhouse is an unusual construction of hand mixed poured concrete (corrected to hand-poured lime and sand grout).

A proposal to alter the farm has been submitted. The proposal is to add a barn quilt to the barn or silo to only one of the proposed locations. The locations proposed are the hay door on the north elevation of the barn to which the barn quilt would be attached on blocks and not flush to the door; the east or west elevations of the barn to which the barn quilt would hang from the rafters with cables; or the east elevation of the silo to which the barn quilt would be attached to two wood posts and not actually touch the silo.

A barn quilt is a pattern taken from a quilt block and transferred to a 4' x 4' panel which is then mounted on a building, typically a barn but also other rural structures. Barn quilt groups have sprung up across the United States and Canada recently to create quilt trails or driving tours with several barn quilts on display. Patterns chosen often have a regional significance.

Adorning barns with patterns has a long but geographically-isolated history in the United States dating back to at least the 1850s in the Pennsylvania Dutch region. Hex signs, as they are known, are part of Pennsylvania Dutch folk art tradition and can be found on barns throughout southeastern Pennsylvania.

While barn quilts are not the same as hex signs, they do evoke the Pennsylvania Dutch folk art tradition and several barn quilt websites specifically mention the tradition as inspiration. However, regardless of whether or not there is any perceived association, the introduction of non-historic elements on historic structures is contrary to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation as well as to the Boulder County criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

## Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. **Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.**

## Land Use Code, Article 15-600

### F. Criteria for Approval of Alterations Requested Under a CA

2. In considering the application for a CA, HPAB uses the following criteria:
  - d. *The proposed alterations do not destroy or substantially impair the historic significance of the structure, site, or district.*
  - e. *Every reasonable effort shall be made to ensure that the proposed alteration preserves, enhances, or restores the significant architectural features which are important to the designated historic landmark.*
  - f. *The proposed architectural style, arrangement, texture, color, and materials are compatible with the character of the historic landmark.*

## RECOMMENDATION

Staff finds that the proposal for a barn quilt on the Shannon Farm does not meet the Criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness and recommends denial of CA-16-0004. The introduction of a non-historic element is not appropriate and is contrary to Criteria b and c of the Land Use Code. Not only is a barn quilt not part of the Shannon Farm's rich history, it could easily be interpreted as a hex sign from the Pennsylvania Dutch heritage, which is clearly not appropriate for a Boulder County landmark.

Applicant and owner, Carol Affleck, spoke about the proposal, made several corrections to the history of the farm in the staff recommendation, and was available to answer questions.

## OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

## CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT

**MOTION:** Steven Barnard MOVED that HPAB deny Docket CA-16-0004: Shannon Farm

**SECOND:** Stan Nilson

**VOTE:** Motion PASSED unanimously

**MOTION:** Steven Barnard MOVED that HPAB would consider a free-standing quilt sign if a proposal is brought back

**SECOND:** Stan Nilson

**VOTE:** Motion PASSED unanimously

c. **Docket CA-16-0005: Wagon Wheel Lodge**

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for repairs to foundation  
Location: 91 Fourmile Canyon Drive  
Zoning: Forestry (F) Zoning  
Applicant: Asa Firestone

Staff member, Denise Grimm, gave the staff presentation. The Wagon Wheel Lodge was landmarked with Boulder County earlier this year. The stone structure was built in the mid-1940s and opened in 1946 as a lodge with cabins and has continued as an important member of the resort community in Boulder County ever since. It was landmarked under the following criteria:

**Criteria #1** - The lodge is significant for its association with the development of the early 20th century mountain resort industry in Boulder County.

**Criteria #4** - The lodge is significant as an example of early 20th century commercial-style architecture.

A proposal to alter the historic lodge has been submitted. The proposal is to add a proper foundation below the structure where presently there is none. The floors of the building will be pulled up and the area for the foundation will be hand-dug. A slab-on-grade foundation will be installed with thickened edges for necessary support. The proposal is not expected to disturb the exterior of the building.

**Land Use Code, Article 15-600**

**F. Criteria for Approval of Alterations Requested Under a CA**

3. In considering the application for a CA, HPAB uses the following criteria:
  - g. *The proposed alterations do not destroy or substantially impair the historic significance of the structure, site, or district.*
  - h. *Every reasonable effort shall be made to ensure that the proposed alteration preserves, enhances, or restores the significant architectural features which are important to the designated historic landmark.*
  - i. *The proposed architectural style, arrangement, texture, color, and materials are compatible with the character of the historic landmark.*

**RECOMMENDATION**

Staff finds that the proposal for foundation repairs to the Wagon Wheel Lodge meet the Criteria for a Certificate of Appropriateness and recommends approval of CA-16-0005. The repairs to the foundation are vital to the survival of the structure.

Applicant, Asa Firestone, spoke about the proposal and was available to answer questions.

**OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT**

None.

CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT

**MOTION:** Steven Barnard MOVED that HPAB APPROVE Docket CA-16-0005: Wagon Wheel Lodge

**SECOND:** Chuck Gray

**VOTE:** Motion PASSED unanimously

**6. GRANT**

a. **HPG-16-0003: Wagon Wheel Lodge**

Location: 91 Fourmile Canyon Drive  
Zoning: Forestry (F) Zoning  
Applicant: Asa Firestone

Proposed work: Repairs to the foundation

**Grant Request: \$10,000.00**

Match: \$20,000.00

Staff is recommending **approval** of the grant request of **\$10,000.00** to repair the foundation. The match provided by the applicants is over the 100% required.

OPEN PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT

**MOTION:** Iiona Dotterer MOVED that HPAB APPROVE grant request HPG-16-0003: Wagon Wheel Lodge for \$10,000.00

**SECOND:** Stan Nilson

**VOTE:** Motion PASSED unanimously

**7. OTHER BUSINESS, PART TWO**

- a. Stan Nilson commented that the applicants were well prepared and had great information.
- b. Denise Grimm reminded members about the HPAB tour to Heil Valley Ranch on June 4<sup>th</sup>.



**8. ADJOURNED**

The Boulder County Historic Preservation Advisory Board meeting was adjourned at 7:55 p.m.

*Detailed information regarding the docket items, including maps and legal descriptions are available for public use at the Land Use Department, 13th and Spruce, Boulder, CO 303-441-3930.*